Ethos, Self, and Identity in the I Ching and Erikson’s Ego-Analytical Psychology*

Randal G. Tonks
Camosun College
Victoria, BC, Canada

*Presented to the International Society for Theoretical Psychology 16th Biennial Conference, Tokyo Japan, August 22, 2017
Abstract

This paper examines the parallel constructions of self in I Ching and the Chinese tradition along side of the Ego-Analytical formulations of Erik Erikson. Common themes and variations found within these theoretical perspectives are examined, including: history and ethos, dialectics, embodiment, grounding in nature, morals and values, healing and therapy. Beginning with a discussion of the sources of the self in China as presented by Yang (2006) a discussion of the need for harmony of self in the ethos and morality of society and in nature. This will be compared with the development of identity within Erikson’s framework recognizing the cultural milieu and ecological circumstance of identity formation. Further comparison of forms of embodiment and movement as seen in the practice of Tai Chi are compared with Erikson’s (1950) configurations of identity. Further discussion of the role of the sifu (master) and the student, doctor and patient within the traditional Taoist systems is made with discussion of the roles of the caregiver and child as well as the therapist and client in Erikson’s (1964) model. A summary of relationships among these views is presented along with a critical analysis following Valsiner (2015).
Introduction: Comparison of traditions

Over the past several decades there has been a growth of interest in bridging psychological theory across cultural traditions in psychology (Paranjpe, 1998; Hsu, 1985; Roland, 1988) and in anthropology (Heelas & Lock, 1981; Jahoda, 1982). This paper examines the parallel constructions of self and ethos in the I Ching and the Chinese tradition along with the ego-analytical formulations of Erik Erikson. Common themes and variations found within these theoretical perspectives are examined, including: dialectics, self, embodiment and grounding in nature, morals and healing. Following a review of these central ideas, and points of comparison, a brief discussion of critique and synthesis of traditions is made.

Dialectics

The Chinese system of thought, and the accompanying I Ching, is thoroughly dialectical. The foundational assumption of the Tao, of yin and yang, is central where the whole system is comprised of a dynamic flow of yin and yang, making a holistic relationship between them (see figure 1). According to Taoism (Lao Tsu, 1989; Wong, K, 1996; Zhu, 2003) all things are comprised of yin and yang and the flow between states of more yin to more yang and back again. Yin, represents the “shaded side of the mountain”, reception, cool, night, and feminine while yang represents the “light side of the mountain”, extension, warm, daytime and masculine. The waxing and waning cycles of the moon from new through to full and back are an easily recognizable manifestation of the cycles of the Tao (yin & yang) as are the seasons of the year.

Likewise Erikson’s system of psycho-analysis is also built upon dialectics. Here it is the relationship between persons that forms a primary dialectic of mutual influence,
as in Plato’s dialogues, as well as through the dynamics of ego epigenesis. Erikson’s dialectics are drawn from the Freudian, Hegelian and hermeneutic traditions (Tonks, 2004). Classical Kantian three part dialectics of *thesis-antithesis* and *synthesis* (see figure 2) forms the basis of ego development of syntonic strengths, dystonic weaknesses and the emergence of ego virtues through rituals of socialization. Erikson applies this foundation of thought to the areas of enviro-anthropogenesis as well as the inter- and intra-personal dynamics of the psyche.

**Self**

Examinations of indigenous psychologies reveal all have notions of self in one form or another (Heelas & Locke, 1981). Heelas & Locke note that indigenous psychologies have notions of the self, based upon essential issues of being in- or under- control and having internalized or externalized conceptualizations. In suite, both the Chinese cosmology, including the contributions of Confucius and the I Ching offer theory on self, as well as the Eriksonian psycho-analysis of identity share elements of all of these features.

**Self in Chinese thought**

The Chinese conception of self has a long history going back millennia and flourishing in the Confucian construction of self. This involves *self* and *other* in a dyadic relationship as part of the more central feature of a quest for sage-hood and self-realization through lifelong commitment to learning.

Yang (2006) presents an historical review of the Chinese indigenous conception of self where he discusses the need for harmony of self in the ethos and morality of society and in nature. He reports that the self in China goes back to antiquity (3000 BC),
built upon the dynamics of yin-yang dialectics. The first crude concept of self arises in the concept of Wo, the self as autonomous and powerful, which arises from early Chinese culture in context of warring land and slave owners (masters). Later, during the Spring-autumn period (770-776 BC) Wu emerges as representing the person in two states of consciousness interchangeably, the embodied and disembodied. This embodied self is founded in everyday circumstances, however it may become disembodied through the use of alcohol or spiritual development. Here the ‘self’ travels (often with the help of mythical animals) to other places including heaven to consult the souls of dead ancestors where it may encounter souls which could cause harm, as when one is outside of their familiar surroundings, and that the harm is brought back to the embodied self (Yang, 2006).

The foundational construction of self emerges during this historical period when the Zhou people set out to control the Yin people by recognizing that the person is situated in society and is regulated by li and yue. Li “is a set of role expectations that guide people’s behaviors” (Yang, 2006, p.334) while yue literally means music, the means through which harmony and the arousal of pleasant emotions helps in the development of li. Yang reports that there is a movement away from spirit and the heavens to worldly qualities for self as conceptualized by the great Confucius. For him moral cultivation of the individual is to be developed to achieve order and harmony of society.
Morals and values (in self development)

Confucius held that a person's moral cultivation (li & yue) is related to bodily changes in three ways: 1) inside the person's body, 2) on the person's appearance, and 3) surrounding the person. Here the development of the individual is a way for the development of society as in the Taoist conception of yin and yang.

Yang (2006) also identifies two characteristic forms of self cultivation that tend to ensue: Jun Zi and Xiao Ren. Jun Zi is a gentleman or great man of the ruling class, a model to strive to become. Xiao Ren, on the other hand represents a small man or 'little people' uncultivated or unknowledgeable, all too common. Through self-cultivation and following the teachings of the wise, one can strive to become Jun Zi, something that is found clearly through the writings of the I Ching (Legge, 1971). Here, inner and outer development occur together, cultivation of inner moral traits are brought to societal development. In following the I Ching, one contemplates the meaning of the hexagrams and corresponding judgment, commentary, great symbolism, and revelation of the lines that describes the preferred course of action for the Superior Man (Jun Zi) who makes wise decisions as well as those of the Small Man (Xiao Ren) who creates havoc (Legge, 1971; also see Appendix A). Important traits of Jun Zi include benevolence consisting of two parts (body and heart-body (mind)), conscience (I-Heart -coming from within), morality (directs the heart), intellect (knowledge and heart). Within this view the person (self) is seen to be the centre of the universe (connected to the heavens) and is valued not by what one is but what one can become and the appropriate actions in which one can engage (Yang, 2006).
Yang (2006) further elaborates on the distinction between Ji, the self as distinguished from others and Ren, the social world around a person. Ji is meaningful when associated with Ren (meaning: human being, in public, an ethnic, or local group, others except oneself); hence the *self is most meaningful when in relation to the group in a whole-part relationship*.

Hsu (1985) also presents a similar model of the Chinese self as Jen within his model of Psycho-Social Homeostasis. Jen, the self that transcends the layers of unexpressible conscious through to intimate family and relations (see figure 3) where the Chinese self is primarily constituted by the "supremacy of kinship" where "self-esteem" arises through identification with one's parents, siblings and close relatives.

Tu (1985) elaborates on the Confucian concept of "self as a dynamic process of spiritual development" acting as the centre of relationships, where self-transformation is "a communal act" (p. 231). Here, the life-long journey of learning and self-development is fostered through "ritualizations" between generations, between fathers and sons.

**History and Ethos**

Within Chinese thought, tradition and history play important roles, particularly in the celebration and honouring of ancestors. Tu (1985) provides a neo-Freudian analysis of selfhood and otherness in Confucian thought. Focusing on relationships between sons and fathers and the ideals of *filial piety*, he shows that various ritualizations are further said to lead to a broadening awareness and self-cultivation through an opening up of self to others. As such, the *mutual caring* for each other and the devotion of the
son to the father (allowing the father to be a father, and the son to be a son), the two can move towards their ideals of self-realization. This connection to the father also transcends towards ancestors from the deeper past which maintains the traditions of self and other development across time and generations. This is the core of Chinese ethos of self, and self development.

**Self in Erikson’s psycho-analysis**

Erik Erikson’s psycho-analytical model of ego identity (1950; 1964; 1982) focuses on the growth and development of the ego within eco-biological and psycho-social realms. His model is grounded in two sets of basic forms, the configurations and the stages of ego development. Erikson (1950) provides a rich description of this configurational model and an application to traditional indigenous and western industrial societies. He also identifies the realms of *soma, psyche* and *ethos (or polis)* as his ontological foundation, representing a “bio-psycho-social” formulation.

This model arises out of the western rationalist tradition of self (Taylor, 1989), beginning with Plato and with a Christian influence (Dumont, 1985), a merging of the Hellenic and Hebraic views (Paranjpe, 1998), which gave rise to the modern individualized ego and self. The person and the self are often found to be distinctions made between the active agent (with social responsibilities) and the passive object (Mauss, 1985; Carrithers, 1985). Erikson clearly follows this tradition as drawn from Sigmund and Anna Freud as well as William James’ (1890/1950) notion of self.

Erikson’s model of configurations is built upon the Freudian erotogenic zones and modes of action that correspond to the psycho-social dynamics in which the person
is raised. Figure 4 shows the configuration modes and zones where one starts in the Oral I zone and moves through the Oral II, Anal, Pre-genital, and Genital zones. Here one can see the primary modes according to developmental zones in the highlighted boxes, where each row signifies a developmental milestone or stage. Beginning with Oral I, the infant is primarily concerned with the incorporation (getting) of nutrition and social experiences. Next stage, Oral II, is when teething begins and biting or taking becomes the new developmental mode. This gives rise to an alteration of the psycho-social relations between the mother and the infant, where discipline of guidance away from biting is necessary which gives rise to a new autonomy and locomotion. The third stage is focused on the anal, where both retention (holding) and expulsion (letting go) are new developmental modes and will be fixated upon one or another style, based upon psycho-social relations with the parents. Likewise, in stage four, the pre-genital modes of inception (masculine) and inclusion (feminine) emerge and are expressed in play forms that are representative of both the cultural standards and the eco-geographic location of the anthropogenesis of that given culture.

For example, Erikson identifies the Sioux of the plains of North America to be oriented towards phallocentric intrusions and are centripetal in style along with anal expulsion in their cultural modes of ritual, work, play and phantasy. In contrast he identifies the Yurok of coastal California as oral and yonicentric (engulfing) in orientation, and are centrifugal in their style of life as seen through ritual, work, play and phantasy. This is followed by the mature development of genital modes which, as suggested above, are represented in the cultural and psycho-social relations of a given people.
Secondly, Erikson identifies eight major crises, or turning points, in the life cycle of human kind that represent responses to evolutionary and developmental needs. These “crises” of development are opportunities for individuals to realize strengths of positive and negative forms along with the emergence of virtues of the ego. As seen in Table 1, the first five of these stages overlap with Erikson’s configurational development, while the last three represent adult development which goes well beyond that of his mentor Freud.

**Virtues and ethics (in self development)**

Erikson (1964) identifies ego strengths or virtues that develop through the dialectics of psycho-social rituals. Beginning with the rituals of feeding and infant care, he identifies the need to develop trust along with mistrust in the growth towards the epigenetic emergence of Hope. This development continues through the other stages where positive ritualization, through psycho-social interaction, will lead to the development of the positive syntonic (thesis) while ritualism will lead to a preponderance of the negative dystonic (antithesis). If the former (syntonic strength) is more dominant, then the ego-virtue will emerge strongly, for example with trust over mistrust in the development of Hope. Throughout childhood the virtuous strengths of: Hope, Will, Purpose, and Competence, will contribute to later ethical development, as does adolescent development of identity and the virtue of Fidelity, which are necessary for the development of ethical strength, where one requires fidelity to adhere to one’s ideals in order to act in an ethical manner (Erikson, 1964).
Erikson (1982) recognizes the developmental levels of childhood, adolescence and adulthood, each with their dialectical value-orientations of moral vs. moralism, ideological vs. totalism, and ethical vs. authoritism. As one develops there is the possibility of the syntonic ethical growth or the dystonic trappings of false ethics. As one moves into the ethical vs. authoritism stage in early adulthood, the virtue of Love emerges and gives rise to “the intimacy of individuals and is thus the basis of ethical concern” (1964, pp. 129-130) where it gives rise to a shared identity. In middle adulthood the virtue of Care emerges as responsibility for children and others become a necessity for most. Here one needs to “experience ‘the other”’ (1964, p. 229) and through this “inter-living” or mutuality, parents guide their children and stimulate the development their virtues and eventual “readiness for ethical action” (1964, p. 232). Through cultural and psycho-social rituals a capacity for ethical action is internalized and then externalized as expressed in action.

In later adulthood the virtue of Wisdom, may emerge for those finding integrity over despair. Erikson (1964) himself, at age 62, turned to Gandhi’s Rule which seeks the “line of action [that] is alone justice which does not harm either party to a dispute” (p. 239). He calls for the development of a truly universal ethics which must genuinely unfold and cannot be fabricated. The challenge is to seek the synthesis of opposites where Erikson states:

[n]o longer do we have license to emphasize either the ‘positive’ or the ‘negative’ in man. Step for step, they go together: moralism with moral obedience, fanaticalism with ideological devotion, and with rigid conservatism with adult ethics (1964, p. 277).
In response, he calls for a more inclusive human identity, something that Paranjpe (1998) recognizes as the identity theory of prejudice that is found within the ancient tradition of Vedanta. Erikson (1964) states that “[j]oint survival demands that man visualize new ethical alternatives fit for newly developing as well as over-developed systems and identities… where a moral universal standard of perfection… will acknowledge the responsibility of each individual for the potentialities of all generations and for each individual” (p. 157).

_History and ethos in Erikson’s psycho-analysis_

History is central to Erikson’s model of identity and his psycho-analysis where he indicates that finding identity is knowing one’s “mythology” or meaning system that ties oneself to a community and its past as well as its future. As such, knowing one’s identity involves knowing _one’s place in history_ and how to contribute to the future prosperity of one’s community and cultural ethos. Erikson states:

> a stage is a new configuration of past and future, a new combination of drive and defense, a new set of capacities fit for a new setting of tasks and opportunities, a new wider radius of significant encounters (1964, p. 166).

Additionally, history plays an important role in the psycho-therapeutic process for Erikson, both for the therapist and for the client, in terms of finding cultural values in traditions of healing (in their ethos), and also in the healing process, as will be elaborated upon shortly.
Embodiment and grounding in nature

Embodiment of elements and forms is central to Taoist and Chinese thought. The self has characteristics of the embodiment of forms of action and thought and is also constructed, as with all things, from the five elements or correspondences. Erikson also embraces embodiment in his configurational model, not only from the epigenesis of “organ modes” (through biological maturation), but also the configurational modes found in psychological, social, cultural, and geo-historical forms, revealing repeated patterns of the configurations.

The Correspondences of Chinese Cosmology

As indicated above, the self in Chinese thought transcends the embodied and disembodied forms. Embodiment takes on two principle manners, first, through the elements and correspondences of traditional Chinese Medicine and secondly through the internalization of forms as seen through the I Ching and in the practices of Tai Chi.

There is a long tradition within Chinese practice that is based upon the interplay of essential elements of being that begins with Huang-ti nei ching (The Yellow Emperor’s Book of Internal Medicine) around 3000 BC. Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) recognizes that like the basic forms of the Tao (yin & yang) there also are five elements that make up all things, including human bodies, each with their own particular configuration. Wood, fire, earth, metal and water are the five elements or correspondences that are manipulated in TCM to “build a Jade Screen” of healthy defensive energy (Zhu, 2003).
Likewise the practice of Feng-Shui also works with these elements in producing healthy environments within particular locations and times (Wong, E., 1996). Each specific being has its own function that must exist in harmony with all other things else there be chaos, catastrophe, and sickness. Thus, mankind must adjust completely with respect to the five elements or correspondences. Figure 5 shows the collection of elements and their cycles of production and destruction that can be used to alter a person, place, or situation. Several of the correspondences are presented in Table 2, where these elements are shown to correspond to the embodiment of: *emotions*, *specific fluids, orifices, organs, tissues, colours, climate, and planets*.

Table 2: Chinese Correspondences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Wood</th>
<th>Fire</th>
<th>Earth</th>
<th>Metal</th>
<th>Water</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotion</td>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>Joy</td>
<td>Compassion</td>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>Fear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluid</td>
<td>Tears</td>
<td>Perspiration</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Mucus</td>
<td>Saliva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orifice</td>
<td>Eyes</td>
<td>Ears</td>
<td>Nose</td>
<td>Lungs</td>
<td>Genitals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organs</td>
<td>Liver /</td>
<td>Heart /</td>
<td>Stomach</td>
<td>Large</td>
<td>Kidneys /</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gall Bladder</td>
<td>SmlIntestine</td>
<td>Intestine</td>
<td>Intestine</td>
<td>UrineBladder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tissue</td>
<td>Ligaments</td>
<td>Arteries</td>
<td>Spleen</td>
<td>Skin &amp; hair</td>
<td>Bones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colour</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>Black</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate</td>
<td>Wind</td>
<td>Heat</td>
<td>Humidity</td>
<td>Dryness</td>
<td>Cold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planet</td>
<td>Jupiter</td>
<td>Mars</td>
<td>Saturn</td>
<td>Venus</td>
<td>Mercury</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Retuning to the I Ching, and its relationship to embodiment, the practice of Tai Chi Chuan is an example of one path towards the pursuit of harmony between body and mind, self and the external world of persons and of nature. As within the I Ching, there are eight basic trigrams that are coupled in pairs to produce the sixty-four possible circumstances or manifestations of the Tao (see appendix A). Learning the I Ching and playing Tai Chi allows an individual to internalize the forms of the I Ching and to
embody it’s principles through the basic eight forms as well as the numerous variations of other extended forms.

*Play & Tai Chi*

These basic eight forms (Heaven, Earth, Water, Fire, Wind, Thunder, Marsh, Mountain) are found in the basic movements of Tai Chi Chuan as seen in figure 6 (Wong,K., 1996). These are patterns of the embodiment of I Ching forms and Tai Chi applications that run parallel to the configurations seen in Erikson’s model. Opening and closing of the body occur along with absorbing and expelling, as well as “biting” and “penetrating” (Zhang, 1992). Additionally, the five elements are also found in basic forms of Tai Chi movement as seen in figure 7. Together these representative trigram and elemental forms allow the Tai Chi practitioner to integrate the philosophy of the I Ching along with the playing of Tai Chi movement, providing a rich and deep understanding of the ethos of Chinese culture. Furthermore, much as the I Ching calls for action (as in confronting K’an – the perilous pit) or Retreat (as in Tun) the Tai Chi practitioner learns when to engage and Ward Off (*Peng*) or retreat in Rolling Back (*Lu*).

*Erikson’s configurations*

As suggested above, Erikson’s (1950) configurations of identity represent the embodiment of nature, culture, and ritual into the “organ modes”. He provides a number of case studies illuminating the manners in which culture and both ritualizations and ritualisms of ego development become “fixated”. These embodied forms, come to influence various aspects of an individual’s experience, *play, phantasy, work,*
relationships, and culture; in part as an embodiment of the ecological niche that a culture emerges through geo-anthropogenesis.

He gives extensive examples of the parallel forms of play and organ modes that are found in various cultural forms and in the specific psycho-social relations of individuals. Cultural rituals like the sun dance for the Sioux and the sweat lodge for the Yurok represent the phallic (inceptive) and yoni (inclusive) forms, according to Erikson, as are their forms of buffalo hunting (with spears) and salmon fishing (with nets). The style of play of children also represents these forms and the types of relationships among people will also represent embodiments of these organ modes (see Tonks, in preparation). Here there is a parallel between the individual organ mode fixations, the nature of psycho-social relations, rituals, and eco-geological circumstance, where the forms of nature become embodied in the cultural practices and psycho-social modes of its community members.

**Doctor-patient, master-disciple relations**

Generative relationships are crucial to both systems of thought as seen through the relationships between the doctor and patient, the caregiver and child, as well as the sifu (master) and the disciple (student).

*In TCM and in Tai Chi*

Traditional Chinese Medicine explicitly recognizes the mutual dependence of the doctor and patient in promoting and bringing about health. According to Zhu (2003) the doctor and the patient share responsibility for health, where *wei qi* (defensive energy) is developed through practices like acupuncture and herbal treatments to return balance
and harmony in the body. Following, and in between visits to the TCM practitioner, the patient has the responsibility to follow the treatments set forth by the practitioner and also to engage in self-enhancing practices like Tai Chi, Chi Kong, and Feng-Shui to enable their wei qi to flow smoothly through the body and stave off illness.

Likewise, Tai Chi master and disciple relations reflect the same patterns of self-development as described above. The sifu or teacher requires an eager and willing student who will follow and learn to lead. The playing of Tai Chi is directed towards the learning of the forms of basic stance, movement and application in two-person forms such as push hands or San Shou (Yiu, 1981).

*Healing and wellness*

Healing in the Chinese tradition falls in line with learning and the pursuit of great self-cultivation. Unlike the typical western medical (firefighter) notion of treating illness once it arises, the TCM practitioner is like a house-keeper, with concern for the whole of wellness through fixing the weakest link of health, and keeping health present while avoiding disease. The practitioner begins by taking pulses, looking at the tongue and in the eyes of the patient. Once a determination of the imbalance causing the reported complaint is made, a treatment of acupuncture, herbal medicine, and / or massage and diet will follow.

Furthermore, wellness is sought by followers of the I Ching and TCM through: understanding one’s unfolding circumstance by consulting the I Ching, knowing and manipulating one’s living or working environment through Feng-Shui, and by fostering internal organ massage, balance, breathing, and strength through playing Tai Chi.
Together, these practices enable the follower of “the way” to make the most of living across a number of embedded spheres of the Tao.

*In Psycho-analysis*

For Erikson, the relationship between the analyst and the analysand is also a partnership where through transference and counter transference a “mutuality of praxis” (1964, p. 236, italics added) emerges and the doctor can “develop as a practitioner, and as a person, even as the patient is cured as a patient, and as a person” (1964, p. 236). He also recognizes an ethical responsibility of the analyst where “[t]he healer is committed to a highest good, the preservation of life, and the furtherance of well-being—‘maintenance of life’ … to a humanistic ethic” (1964, p. 237). He further states that “we cannot afford to live for long with a division of personal, professional and political ethics” (1964, p. 241).

*Therapeutic process*

According to Erikson (1964) the typical course of a psychotherapeutic encounter begins with a complaint, then anamnesis (understanding the cause) and interpretation follows with the goal of providing insight for the patient and subsequently self-activation in the form of “actuality and reality *wirklichkeit* – that is activity and efficacy with reality” (p. 164). The therapist and client together engage in disciplined subjectivity to achieve a shared understanding and insight of the precipitant problem, and through the mutual activation of transference and counter-transference they will bring about change.

It is through the mutuality of this therapeutic relationship that the therapist can help to guide the patient from passivity into activity and self-reliance. This shared insight
is done “for and with [the] client” (1964, p. 80). Central to his therapeutic process is also the “history making” method that he draws from R.G. Collingwood (1956). Through engaging in therapy, there is a process of “taking [medical] history” where the client becomes “a case” and is self-observant. Through this process, the clinician becomes part of the client’s life history as the client “makes history” (1964, p. 56). Erikson states that while:

‘under observation,’ he [sic] becomes self-observant. As a patient he is inclined, and as a client often encouraged, to historicize his position by thinking to the onset of the disturbance, and to ponder what world order (magic, scientific, ethical) was violated and must be restored before his self-regulation can be reassumed. He participates in becoming a case, a fact which he may live down socially, but which, nevertheless, may forever change his view of himself (1964, p. 54, italics original).

Summary and Conclusions

This paper has provided an account of theoretical perspectives from Chinese Taoism and Euro-American Psycho-analysis. While several attempts to draw together these views has occurred in the past (i.e., Hsu, 1985; Tu, 1985), this present account has focused on the relational self and the development of virtues and ethics within eco-historical traditions.

Similarities between these views have been identified regarding the foundations in dialectics, self as relational, historical, and striving for ideal ethical development. Furthermore, comparisons of the embodiment of nature into self and the role of play in
self development have been made along with the generative characteristics of the
doctor-patient/ teacher-student relations in healing and learning. Both are ideal systems
of self development incorporating and embodying formal qualities in spite of differences
in the details of their manifestations.

Critique

Valsiner (2015) identifies inherent challenges in critical psychology that can be
applied to theories from various traditions. He suggests that critical psychology can
come in one of two forms: criticism and critique. Criticism, he suggests often becomes
damnation and tends to come in waves and fads. Criticism as deconstruction, he
suggests, leaves nothing, while re-construction may become uncritical and render itself
useless. Instead he calls for a critique approach that involves collaboration. Here
critique becomes constructive, taking a Vygotskian approach to learning through
dialectics by presenting opposing views and developing a synthesis of them.

In that spirit, this paper has set out to present these two systems of psychology,
identifying points of convergence and divergence of thought and providing a foundation
for the synthesis of these views. Some critique of these views will be raised along with a
brief discussion of the potential for the growth of each view through comparison and
contrast with the other, as well as the emergence of a synthesis of the two.

Taoism and TCM have often been criticized for being based upon belief in
correspondences and magical thinking (What is TCM?, 2012) and not really medicine
itself. Likewise psycho-analysis has also been criticized as offering mythological and
fantastic interpretations that have no grounding in reality. Erikson replies, however that
“proof lies in the way in which communication between therapist and patient ‘keeps moving’, leading to new and surprising insights” (1964, p. 75).

Zittoun et al. (2013) are also critical of Erikson’s “trajectory” of identity development, indicating that it does not account for the actual diversity of life trajectories that unfold across cultural systems. However, Erikson (1964) was aware of this challenge stating:

[a]n attempt to construct a ground plan of human strengths, however, could be accused of neglecting diversities. . . . Yet the life processes will always lead to more diversity than we can comfortably manage with our insights, our cures and our aspirations (p. 156).

Tu (1985) additionally contrasts the Chinese ideal of *filial piety* with the classical Freudian *oedipal conflict* showing a divergence of theory, in spite of congruence between the Chinese self-concept and the Eriksonian model of identity. This follows the plethora of anthropological studies by the Boasians Margaret Mead, Ruth Benedict and Stanislow Malinowski who were critical of the universal claims of Freudian theory (Jahoda, 1982). In spite of these critical challenges remedies may unfold through such critical comparisons and the dialogical “feedback” from one to the other in a constructive manner as Valsiner (2015) suggests.

*Synthesis*

While these and other possible similarities and differences may be discovered among these two intellectual traditions it is possible to develop new systems of thought
that represent one or another synthesis of these views. Gadamer and followers have extensively described the possibilities of the fusion of horizons of intellectual traditions where new insight and an enrichment of both systems may come about (Bernstein, 1988; Tonks, 2004; Valsiner, 2014) through a dialectical approach to the integration of systems of psychology. As such, one might consider that the psycho-analytical understanding of ego and identity can contribute to understanding the Chinese self (Hsu, 1985; Tu, 1985). Further cross-fertilization between these views can be found in the application of I Ching in western therapy as a form of *logo therapy* in dealing with potential anxiety and rage that may be present (Erikson, 1950). Additionally, a more detailed analysis of the *emotion, organ, and tissue embodiment* in TCM can be examined in terms of psycho-analytic emotional and configurational embodiment for specific emotional profiles. Likewise the application of *Tai Chi play* can be *therapeutically* helpful in releasing, or revealing, embodied trauma as seen through the Eriksonian configurational model. Conversely the complements of *mutuality and expressions of wisdom* may be drawn from the Eriksonian model and applied to the situations of *filial piety* in the Chinese self development. Other theoretical perspectives may also be brought to bear along side of these, for example to examine *Activity Theory* with respect to the role of play and ritual in these views (Cole, 1996; Tonks, in preparation). I look forward to the future development of knowledge transfer and emergence from these and other such activities.
References


Appendix A: I Ching and Tai Chi

Chien – Heaven male, active, creative – Ward Off – Peng
K’un – Earth, female, passive, receptive – Roll Back – Lu
Sun – Wind, wood, gentle, penetration – Pull Down – Tsai (Cai)
Chen – Thunder, movement, perilousness – Split – Lieh
K’an – Water, pit, danger – Press – Chi (qi)
Li – Fire, brightness, beauty – Push – An
Ken – Mountain, arresting progress – Shoulder – Kao
Tui – Marsh, lake, pleased satisfaction – Elbow – Zhou

Using the I Ching, a person “throws” yarrow stalks or coins six times for building the hexagram which consists of an inner and an outer trigram. The trigrams each have their own meaning and when combined with another form one of the sixty-four possible conditions. When three heads are tossed it is a yang moving line of 9, two heads and one tail is a yin line of 8, two tails and one head is a yang line of 7, and three tails is a yin mobbing line of 6.

Once drawn, the I Ching reading reveals a judgment, a commentary, the great symbolism and the meaning of moving lines. The judgment is based upon the nature of the hexagram giving a general condition in which one finds oneself. Commentary is an elaboration on the meaning of the judgment, and the great symbolism draws together this meaning in a synoptic manner. Moving lines represent refined influence of the immediate circumstance (as drawn by the person throwing the stones) upon the great symbolism. Choice between what the superior man or the small man would do is usually presented within the reading, giving the person throwing an opportunity to reflect upon their current situation and consider alternative courses of action.

For example, the following hexagram was drawn in anticipation of attending this conference:

```
--x--  --o--
--o--  --x--
-----  ----
--    -- --
--x--  --0--
-----  ----
```

Sui (17)  K’uei (38)

Here the yang (8) lines are designated by ----- and the yin (7) lines are designated by -- -- while the moving yang (9) lines are represented by --o—and --x—represented the moving yin (6) lines.
With moving lines there is the possibility of transformation into the other when yin becomes yang or yang becomes yin, and in this example the hexagram Sui can thus transform into the hexagram K’uei.

**Sui – Following**

The *Judgement* for Sui indicate that there will be great progress and success, however it will be advantageous to be firm and correct.

*Commentary* on this indicates that there will be great progress and success as the strong (trigram) placed under the weak gives rise to movement and pleasure, and that through firm correctness no error will be made where “all under heaven will be found following at such a time”.

*The Great Symbolism* is (waters) of marsh and thunder in the midst of it, where “the superior man in accordance with this, when it is getting towards dark, enters (his house) and rests.”

Six in two – the second line a divided moving lines indicates that “one who cleaves to the little boy, and lets go the man of age and experience. (he cannot be with the two at the same time).

Nine in Five – (the ruler) sincere in (fostering all) his that is excellent, where this position is correct and in the centre.

Six on top – indicates that sincerity is firmly held and clung to, yea, and bound fast, as a King with it presenting his offerings on the western mountain. (external development)

**K’uei – Disunion**

*The judgment* for K’uei indicates mutual alienation

*Commentary* indicates that with a fire burning over a marsh. In small matters there will be good success. Heaven and earth are separated, male and female are separate and apart but with common will they seek the same object.

The *Great Symbolism* here is of fire and water where the superior man, in accordance with this, where there is general agreement, yet admits diversity.

Nine in two – shows the subject happening to meet with his lord in a bye-passage, but not deviated from the proper course; there will be no error.

Six in five – Occasion for repentance will disappear. With his minister he unites closely and readily – like biting through a piece of skin. When he goes forward what error can there be?

Nine on top – solitary amidst the disunion, like seeing a pig bearing on his back a load of mud, a carriage full of ghosts. He bends his bow against him, then unbends it discovering he is not an assailant to injure but a near relative. He shall meet with gentle rain and there will be good fortune, passing away of all doubts.
## Notable Hexagrams

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hexagram</th>
<th>Symbolism</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td><strong>Waiting</strong></td>
<td>Clouds ascending over sky form Hsu. In accordance, the superior man eats, and drinks and feasts (As if there were nothing else to occupy him).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hsu</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’an</strong></td>
<td>-With the sincerity declared within it there will be brilliant success. -With firmness there will be good fortune, it is advantageous to cross the great stream.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Water</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’an</strong></td>
<td>He who in accordance with this established the various states, and maintained affectionate relations with their princes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heaven</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ch’ien</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td><strong>Union</strong></td>
<td>The earth and over it water for Pi. The ancient kings in accordance with this established the various states, and maintained affectionate relations with their princes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pi</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’an</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Water</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’an</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Earth</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’un</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td><strong>Treading carefully</strong></td>
<td>Sky above and below it marsh for Lu. The superior man, in accordance with this, discriminates between high and low, and gives settlement to the aims of the people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lu</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ch’ien</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heaven</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ch’ien</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marsh</strong></td>
<td><strong>Tui</strong></td>
<td>-Suggests of one treading on the tai of a tiger which does not bite him. -There will be progress and success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>Peace</strong></td>
<td>Heaven and earth in communication together for T’ai. The sage (sovereign), in harmony with this, fashions and completes his regulation according to them and in order for the benefit of people Little gone, great come; there will be good fortune with progress and success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T’ai</strong></td>
<td><strong>K’un</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Earth</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ch’ien</strong></td>
<td>Little gone, great come; there will be good fortune with progress and success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Heaven</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ch’ien</strong></td>
<td>Little gone, great come; there will be good fortune with progress and success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>21</strong></td>
<td><strong>Biting Through</strong></td>
<td>Thunder and lightning for Shih Ho. The ancient kings in accordance with this framed their penalties with intelligence and promulgated their laws. -Indicates successful progress in its conditions. IT will be advantageous to use legal constraints.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shih Ho</strong></td>
<td><strong>Li</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire</strong></td>
<td><strong>Chen</strong></td>
<td>-The will be good fortune, but let (him) re-examine himself, whether his virtue be great and un-intermitting and firm. If so there will be no error. Those who have not rest will come to him: those who come late - ill.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Perilous Pit

-Great Symbolism: Water flowing on continuously forms K’an

K’an

The superior man, in accordance with this, maintains constantly the virtue (of his heart) and (the integrity of) his conduct, and practices the business of instruction.

Water

-shows the possession of sincerity, through which the mind is penetrating. Action will be of high value.

K’an

Retreat

-Great Symbolism: Sky and below it that of mountain form Tun.

Tun

The superior man, in accordance with this, keeps small men at a distance, not by showing he hates them, but by his dignified gravity.

Heaven

-Ch’ien

-Mountain

-Ken

-indicates successful progress. To a small extend it will (still) be advantageous to be firm and correct.

Family

-Great Symbolism: Fire and wind coming from it form Chia Jen.

Chia Jen

-The superior man, in accordance with this, orders his words according to the truth of things: makes his conduct consistent.

Wind/Wood

-Sun

-Fire(Brightness)

-Li

-what is realized or the regulation of family-what is most important is that the wife be firm and correct.

Removing Corruption

-Great Symbolism: Heaven and marsh above it form Kuai.

Kuai

-Marsh

-Heaven

-Ch’ien

-The superior man in accordance with this, bestows emolument on those below him, and dislikes having his gifts accumulate (undispensed)

-Marshal

-Heaven

-Ch’ien

-Requires the exhibition of the culprit’s guilt in a royal court, and sincere and earnest appeal with a consciousness of the peril. He should also make an announcement in his own city and show no recourse to arms.

-Joy – Pleasure

-Great Symbolism: The double waters of marsh overlaid form Tui.

Tui

-Marsh

-Marsh

-The superior man, in accordance with this, encourages conversation of friends and stimulates their common practice.

-Tui

-Marsh

-Marsh

-There will be progress and attainment, but it will be advantageous to be firm and correct.
Figure 1: The yin-Yang or Tao symbol

Figure 2: The nature of dialectics
Figure 3: Hsu’s Psycho-Social Homeostasis model of the Chinese Self - Jen
Figure 4: Erikson’s Configurational Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Stages</th>
<th>B Criteria of the Healthy Personality</th>
<th>C Social Radius</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I “Oral” and “Sensory”</td>
<td>Trust vs. Mistrust</td>
<td>“Existence,” mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II “Muscular” and “Anal”</td>
<td>Autonomy vs. Shame, Doubt</td>
<td>Mother, father etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III “Lusomotor” and “Infantile-genital”</td>
<td>Initiative vs. Guilt</td>
<td>Parents; siblings, playgroups, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV “Latency”</td>
<td>Industry vs. Inferiority</td>
<td>Schoolmasters, teachers etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V “Pubertal” and “Adolescence”</td>
<td>Identity vs. Diffusion</td>
<td>Cliques, social prototypes, two sexes, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI “Young Adulthood”</td>
<td>Intimacy vs. Isolation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII “Adulthood”</td>
<td>Generativity vs. Self-Absorption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII “Maturity”</td>
<td>Integrity vs. Despair</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Erikson’s stages of Ego virtue development
Figure 5: Five elements and cycles of production and destruction
Figure 6: The Basic 8 Trigrams and corresponding Tai Chi movement

Figure 7: The Five Activities corresponding to the elements
Figure 8: The bagua of 8 trigrams and yin-yang